

Message Text

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 TEL AV 01065 01 OF 02 121403Z

46

ACTION NEA-10

INFO OCT-01 EUR-12 ISO-00 SAM-01 SAB-01 IO-11 SSM-03

CIAE-00 DODE-00 PM-04 H-02 INR-07 L-03 NSAE-00 NSC-05

PA-01 PRS-01 SP-02 SS-15 USIA-06 ACDA-05 AID-05 MC-02

OMB-01 EB-07 COME-00 TRSE-00 FEAE-00 INT-05 OES-03

ERDA-05 /118 W

----- 050176

R 121250Z FEB 76

FM AMEMBASSY TEL AVIV

TO SECSTATE WASHDC 151

INFO AMEMBASSY AMMAN

AMEMBASSY BEIRUT

AMEMBASSY CAIRO

AMEMBASSY DAMASCUS

AMCONSUL JERUSALEM

AMEMBASSY LONDON

AMEMBASSY JIDDA

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 1 OF 2 TEL AVIV 1065

E.O. 11652: N/A

TAGS: PFOR IS US

SUBJECT: FORMER MOD ADVISER ATTACKS GOI AND US POLICIES

SUMMARY: HARSH CRITICISM OF RABIN GOVERNMENT AND US
MIDDLE EAST POLICY BY YUVAL NEEMAN, FORMER CHIEF ADVISER TO DEFENSE
MINISTER PERES AND CHIEF IDF SCIENTIST, HAS
ATTACHED EXTENSIVE ATTENTION IN ISRAELI POLITICAL CIRCLES.
COMING AT SAME TIME THAT RABIN HAS COME UNDER SHARP
DOMESTIC ATTACK FOR BACKGROUND COMMENTS WHILE IN US ON
ISRAELI ARMS REQUESTS (IN PREPARATION OF WHICH NEEMAN
PLAYED CENTRAL ROLE) AND REVIVAL OF SPECULATION THAT
US AND ISRAEL MAY BE EXPLORING JORDANIAN OPTION,
NEEMAN'S ARTICLE HAS PROVIDED POTENT AMMUNITION
FOR ISRAELI HARDLINERS. NEEMAN CHARGES THAT US SINCE
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 TEL AV 01065 01 OF 02 121403Z

1973 WAR REGARDS ISRAEL AS "NUISANCE STATE WHICH

MUST BE INDUCED TO WITHDRAW FROM OCCUPIED TERRITORIES

TO PROMOTE US REGIONAL INTERESTS. GOI HAS BECOME
DEPENDENT SATELLITE OF US, AND BY AGREEING TO STEP-BY-STEP APPROACH,
HAS CONTRIBUTED TO EROSION OF ISRAELI SECURITY. NEEMAN ALSO ASSERTS
THAT ADMINISTRATION HAS MANIPULATED EXECUTIVE-CONGRESSIONAL
HANDLING OF ISRAELI AID REQUESTS TO MINIMIZE ITS COMMIT-
MENTS TO ISRAEL AND HAS WITHHELD ACTUAL FUNDING IN
CARROT-AND-STICK PROCESS OF EXTRACTING ADDITIONAL
TERRITORIAL CONCESSIONS. FINALLY, NEEMAN WARNS THAT
WITHDRAWAL FROM WEST BANK COULD RESULT IN 50-100,000
ISRAELI CASUALTIES IN RESISTING ARAB-LAUNCHED ATTACK
AGAINST ISRAEL PROPER. END SUMMARY.

1. PROFESSOR YUVAL NEEMAN, ISRAELI HAWK PUBLICLY

IDENTIFIED WITH GREATER LAND OF ISRAEL MOVEMENT AND
SUPPORTER OF GUSH EMUNIM RELIGIOUS SETTLERS, PUBLISHED
LENGTHY ARTICLE FEBRUARY 6 IN KHAARETZ EXPLAINING
REASONS FOR HIS RESIGNATION AS DEFENSE MINISTER PERES'
CHIEF ADVISOR AND IDF CHIEF SCIENTIST. NEEMAN, WHO HAD
ASSUMED THESE POSITIONS IN JANUARY 1975, RESIGNED THE
FIRST OF THEM IN PROTEST AGAINST SINAI II IN SEPTEMBER
1975 AND THE LATTER LAST WEEK. IN HIS DUAL CAPACITY,
NEEMAN HAD BEEN MAJOR FIGURE IVN ISRAELI DEFENSE
ESTABLISHMENT DURING SINAI II NEGOTIATIONS, AS WELL
AS RESPONSIBLE FOR PREPARATION OF ARMS PROCUREMENT
LISTS AND LONG-TERM STRATEGIC AND DEFENSE PLANNING.
AS INSIDER WITH PRESTIGIOUS PROFESSIONAL REPUTATION--
HE WAS PRESIDENT OF TEL AVIV UNIVERSITY BEFORE ENTERING
DEFENSE MINISTRY--HIS
MIDDLE EAST POLICY HAS INEVITABLY BEEN
SEIZED ON BY
ISRAELI HARDLINERS TO BOLSTER THEIR CASE. FOLLOWING
ARE KEY POINTS OF NEEMAN ARTICLE (JERUSALEM POST
SUMMARY BEING POUCHED TO DEPARTMENT).

2. ISRAEL AND SINAI II. NEEMAN CLAIMS THAT BY MARCH
1975 IT WAS CLEAR THAT THE EGYPTIANS HAD NO INTENTION
OF GIVING ISRAELI ANYTHING THAT WENT SIGNIFICANTLY
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 TEL AV 01065 01 OF 02 121403Z

BEYOND THE JANUARY 1974 DISENGAGEMENT AGREEMENT. BUT
UNDER US PRESSURE, "ISRAEL WAS TO GIVE UP VALUABLE GEO-
GRAPHICAL, MILITARY AND ECONOMIC PROPERTIES TO EGYPT,
AND IN RETURN EGYPT WOULD GIVE US INFLUENCE MORE PLAY
IN THE REGION WHILE KEEPING THE RUSSIANS ON ICE. AND
WHAT WAS GOOD FOR THE US..WAS GOOD FOR ISRAEL..."
NEEMAN ASSERTS THAT AS COMPENSATIOPLITIMSFUL
ISRAELI WITHDRAWALS US PROMISED MASSIVE AID TO BALANCE

THE FLOW OF RUSSIAN ARMS TO THE ARABS. BUT, HE WRITES, ISRAEL DISCOVERED THAT AGREEMENTS AND PROMISES GIVEN BY US PRESIDENTS WOULD NOT BE KEPT BECAUSE OF THE RELATIONS BETWEEN THE ADMINISTRATION AND CONGRESS. MOREOVER, AN ENTIRE FISCAL YEAR (1975), HAD BEEN LOST, "AND THE TEN YEAR PROGRAM OF MILITARY SUPPLY THAT HAD BEEN TALKED OF IN CONNECTION WITH GIVING UP KUNEITRA BEGAN WITH A YEAR IN WHICH ISRAEL DID NOT RECEIVE ONE THIN DIME IN NEW ALLOCATIONS FOR DEFENSE."

3. NEEMAN BELIEVES THAT IT WAS UNREALISTIC FOR ISRAEL TO THINK OF MASSIVE LONG TERM US AID AS THE PROPER RETURN FOR THE ONE-SIDED CONCESSIONS TO EGYPT GIVEN US ECONOMIC SITUATION AND POLITICAL ATMOSPHERE. ISRAEL SHOULD HAVE SOUGHT TO OBTAIN BINDING POLITICAL COMMITMENTS FROM THE US AND COULD HAVE OBTAINED CONGRESSIONAL APPROVAL FOR AGREED SOLUTIONS CONCERNING ISRAEL PRESENCE ON THE WEST BANK AND THE GOLAN HEIGHTS AS WELL AS OTHER POLITICAL ISSUES.

4. US-ISRAELI MEMORANDUM OF AGREEMENT. NEEMAN WRITES THAT "THE GOI HAS MISINFORMED THE PUBLIC OF THE CONTENTS OF THE AGREEMENT--THE ORIGINAL DOCUMENT QHSS(1) #

RABIN GOVERNMENT AND THE KNESSET FOREIGN AFFAIRS AND DEFENSE COMMITTEE WAS COMPLETELY ALTERED BY THE AMERICANS. IN THIS WRETCHED DOCUMENT EVERY JOINT AMERICAN-ISRAELI AGREEMENT REGARDING OUR STAND WAS REPHRASED IN TERMS OF AN AMERICAN DECLARATION THAT 'THE US NOTES THAT THIS IS THE ISRAELI POSITION' - AND NOTHING MORE. FURTHERMORE, MANY CLAUSES HAD VANISHED COMPLETELY...
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 04 TEL AV 01065 01 OF 02 121403Z

THE DOCUMENT THAT REMAINED (EXCEPT PERHAPS FOR OIL CLAUSE) WAS HARDLY WORTH THE PAPER IT WAS PRINTED ON..." NEEMAN ATTRIBUTES THE CHANGE OF DRAFT TO ONE OF "KISSINGER'S BAZAAR BARGAINING PLOYS." ISRAEL COULD HAVE ACTED DIFFERENTLY, AS IT DID FOR INSTANCE IN INSISTING ON US GUARANTEE OF ISRAEL'S OIL SUPPLY IF PRODUCERS REFUSE TO SELL. THIS HAD PAID OFF, KISSINGER BACKED DOWN AND THE ORIGINAL CLAUSE WAS REINSTATED WITH IMPROVEMENTS. AT SAME TIME WITHDRAWAL FROM ABU-RODEIS HAS MADE ISRAEL COMPLETELY DEPENDENT ON OTHER ENERGY SOURCES. HAD ISRAEL RECEIVED US GUARANTEES OF POLITICAL BACKING, THE LOSS OF INDEPENDENCE IN ENERGY WOULD NOT POLITICALLY BE VERY DANGEROUS. "BUT WHEN THE AGREEMENT WITH THE US IS VOID OF CONTENT, WE ARE BOOBY TRAPPING OUR FUTURE IN A FRIGHTENING WAY..."

5. US-ISRAELI RELATIONS. NEEMAN SAYS THAT ISRAEL HAS BECOME AN AMERICAN SATELITE. "WE HAVE LOST ALL SEMBLANCE OF BEING A SELF-RESPECTING INDEPENDENT STATE WITH ITS OWN NATIONAL INTERESTS..." "US POLICY TO WHICH ISRAEL IS NOW BEING BOUND--SHAPED BY A MAN WHO IS (DESPITE HIS PUBLICITY) A RUTHLESS IMPROVISER WHO SEES NO MORE THAN A FEW MONTHS AHEAD--IS BASED ON STRENGTHENING AN EGYPT-SAUDI ARABIAN-IRANIAN AXIS TO ENSURE THE FLOW OF OIL. ISRAEL-ARAB PEACE IS NOT A FACTOR; KISSINGER CONSIDERS IT A UTOPIAN DREAM."

6. ISRAELI DEFENSE POLICY. NEEMAN SAYS THAT IT IS

NOTE BY OC/T: #GARBLED TEXT AS RECEIVED

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 TEL AV 01065 02 OF 02 121457Z

46

ACTION NEA-10

INFO OCT-01 EUR-12 ISO-00 SAM-01 SAB-01 IO-11 SSM-03

CIAE-00 DODE-00 PM-04 H-02 INR-07 L-03 NSAE-00 NSC-05

PA-01 PRS-01 SP-02 SS-15 USIA-06 ACDA-05 AID-05 MC-02

OMB-01 EB-07 COME-00 TRSE-00 FEAE-00 INT-05 OES-03

ERDA-05 /118 W

----- 050905

R 121250Z FEB 76

FM AMEMBASSY TEL AVIV

TO SECSTATE WASHDC 152

INFO AMEMBASSY AMMAN

AMEMBASSY BEIRUT

AMEMBASSY CAIRO

AMEMBASSY DAMASCUS

AMCONSUL JERUSALEM

AMEMBASSY LONDON

AMEMBASSY JIDDA

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 2 OF 2 TEL AVIV 1065

NOT TOO LATE TO WEAN ISRAEL OF DEPENDENCE ON US ARMS AND THAT A US CUTOFF WOULD NOT BE A DISASTER. "WE ARE PREPARED FOR IMMEDIATE WAR FOR THE NEXT SEVERAL YEARS, AND DURING THIS PERIOD, IF WE HAD NO CHOICE, COULDBUILD WHAT WE WOULD NEED FOR THE FOLLOWING YEARS. I DO NOT SEE DEFENSE CONSIDERATIONS AS BEING DECISIVE IN TIPPING THE SCALES TOWARD ACCEPTING AMERICAN DICTATES..."

7. THE WEST BANK. NEEMAN WRITES THAT THE WEST BANK SHOULD RECEIVE AN AUTONOMOUS STATUS AS AN "AREA" WITHIN ISRAEL. WEST BANK TERRITORIAL CONCESSIONS WOULD ONLY LEAD TO A "TERRIBLE WAR", A GENERAL ASSAULT WHICH ISRAEL MIGHT JUST BE ABLE TO WITHSTAND AT THE COST OF 50,000-100,000 CASUALTIES; ENDING IN ANOTHER CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 TEL AV 01065 02 OF 02 121457Z

F
MASADA ON MOUNT CARMEL (NEAR HUIFA) "IF WE WERE QUICK EENOUGH".

8. NATIONAL UNITY GOVERNMENT. NEEMAN CONCLUDES THAT THE PERIOD SINCE OCTOBER 1973 WAR IS EXTENDED REPLAY OF WAITING PERIOD PRECEDING SIX DAY WAR WHICH CONCLUDED WITH ESTABLISHMENT OF NATIONAL UNITY GOVERNMENT AND DECISION TO FIGHT. WHILE ANALOGY WITH TODAY IS INCOMPLETE, ISRAEL NEEDS A CHANGE OF POLITICAL DIRECTION "AND THIS WILL COME WHEN A GOVERNMENT IS SET UP THAT WILL DECIDE TO END OUR INCREASED DEPENDENCE ON THE US AND MAKE ISRAEL ONCE AGAIN A STRONG ALLY RATHER THAN A DESPISED SATELLITE".

9. COMMENT: NEEMAN'S ANALYSIS IS OF NOTE FOR ITS COMPREHENSIVE NATURE AS VIRTUALLY A "CLASSIC" STATEMENT OF THE HARDLINERS CASE. ITS POLITICAL IMPACT IS PERHAPS SOMEWHAT VITIATED BY THE FACT THAT HE IS SO FIRMLY ESTABLISHED IN THE PUBLIC MIND AS A COMMITTED "HAWK", AND HENCE NOT EXACTLY OBJECTIVE. FOR THE FAITHFUL, HIS ARGUMENTS REINFORCE VIEWS ALREADY HELD, WHILE FOR THE FENCESITTERS IN THE LABOR PARTY AND THE NRP THEY PROVIDE ENCOURAGEMENT TO MOVE RIGHTWARD. PUBLIC AIRING OF THIS ANALYSIS--HOWEVER DISTORTED IT IS--CERTAINLY WILL NOT EASE RABIN'S PROBLEM IF HE MOVES TOWARD A JORDANIAN OPTION. FINALLY, NEEMAN'S ATTACK STRIKES US AS A PREVIEW OF WHAT MIGHT HAPPEN WHEN AND IF ARIK SHARON MAKES HIS MOVE.
DUNNIGAN

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: X
Capture Date: 01 JAN 1994
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: ECONOMIC ASSISTANCE, FOREIGN RELATIONS, MILITARY ASSISTANCE, POLITICAL LEADERS, ALLEGATIONS
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Draft Date: 12 FEB 1976
Decaption Date: 01 JAN 1960
Decaption Note:
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Authority: KelleyW0
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 28 MAY 2004
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1976TELAV01065
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: n/a
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: GS
Errors: N/A
Film Number: D760053-1065
From: TEL AVIV
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1976/newtext/t19760253/aaaabura.tel
Line Count: 275
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
Office: ACTION NEA
Original Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Original Handling Restrictions: n/a
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 6
Previous Channel Indicators: n/a
Previous Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Reference: n/a
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Authority: KelleyW0
Review Comment: n/a
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 17 MAY 2004
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review History: RELEASED <17 MAY 2004 by ellisoob>; APPROVED <04 OCT 2004 by KelleyW0>
Review Markings:

Margaret P. Grafeld
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
04 MAY 2006

Review Media Identifier:
Review Referrals: n/a
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: FORMER MOD ADVISER ATTACKS GOI AND US POLICIES SUMMARY: HARSH CRITICISM OF RABIN GOVERNMENT AND US
TAGS: PFOR, IS, US, (NEEMAN, YUVAL)
To: STATE
Type: TE
Markings: Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 04 MAY 2006